Career Connect Washington Task Force
Meeting 4 – November 28, 2017 | 4-6pm

Location: Microsoft Conference Center, Building 33, Lassen Room
16070 NE 36th Way | Redmond, WA 98052

4:00pm   **Introductions and Welcome**
Brad Smith & Perry England – Task Force Co-Chairs

Briefing Materials
- Agenda
- Meeting Minutes

4:05pm   **Switzerland Delegation Update – Lessons Learned & Future Commitments**
Perry England, Task Force Co-Chair
Jane Broom, Microsoft

5:00pm   **Task Force Policy Priorities**
Eleni Papadakis, Workforce Board

Briefing Materials
- DRAFT policy solutions
- Comprehensive list of policy ideas

5:50   **Meeting Wrap-up and Planning for Meeting #5**
Perry England & Brad Smith – Task Force Co-Chairs

6:00   **Meeting Adjourn**

<u>**NEXT MEETING**</u>**: January 11, 1-3pm. Location TBD.**

CAREER CONNECT WASHINGTON TASK FORCE MEETING 3 MINUTES

October 30, 2017 | 1-3 PM

Co-Chairs
Perry England, Workforce Board
Brad Smith, Microsoft

Task Force Members
John Aultman, Office of the Governor
Ben Bagherpour, SEH America
Dave D'Hondt, Associated General Contractors of WA/WA State Apprenticeship Council
Maud Daudon, Seattle-King County Metropolitan Chamber of Commerce
Lynne Dodson, Washington State Labor Council
Tim Engle, Saltchuk Resources, Inc.
Shaunta Hyde, Alaska Airlines
Kris Johnson, Association of Washington Business
Steve Johnson, *for Ardine Williams*, Amazon
Caroline King, Washington STEM
Eric Levine, CellarTracker
Suzi Levine, U.S. Ambassador to Switzerland and Liechtenstein (ret.)
Cat Martin, *for Phyllis Campbell*, JPMorgan Chase
William McSherry, Boeing
Michaela Miller *for Chris Reykdal*, Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction
Scott Morris, Avista
Mark Martinez, Washington Building and Trades Council
Representative Sharon Tomiko Santos, Washington State House of Representatives
Brooke Thomas, *for Susan Mullaney*, Kaiser Permanente
Senator Hans Zeiger, Washington State Senate

Guests and Task Force Staff
Esther Bennett, Division of Vocational Rehabilitation
David Beyer, Everett Community College
*Jane Broom, Microsoft
Marie Bruin, Employment Security Department
Linda Drake, State Board of Education
Carolina Brown, Microsoft
Kate Davis, Office of the Governor
Nancy Dick, State Board for Community and Technical Colleges
Briana Durham, Aerospace Joint Apprenticeship Council
Ted Feller, Southwest Washington STEM Network
Amy Goings, Lake Washington Institute of Technology
*Nova Gattman, Workforce Board
Peter Guzman, State Board for Community and Technical Colleges
Teesha Kirschbaum, Washington State Rehabilitation Council
*Amy Liu, Microsoft
Mike Meotti, Washington Student Achievement Council
Natalie Pacholl, SEH America
*Eleni Papadakis, Workforce Board
Brent Parton, New America
Shana Peschek, Construction Center of Excellence
Jenee Myers, University of Washington
*Rebecca Reule, Workforce Board
Andy Shouse, Washington STEM
Liz Smith, Department of Labor and Industries
Mary Snap, Microsoft
Lynne Strickland, Aerospace Joint Apprenticeship Committee
Katherine Taylor, Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction
Becky Wallace, Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction
*Eric Wolf, Workforce Board
Jan Yoshiwara, State Board for Community and Technical Colleges
(* – Denotes staff to the Task Force)

Welcome and Introductions
Task Force Co-Chairs Perry England and Brad Smith **called the meeting to order at 1:00 pm.**

Update on November Meeting
Nova Gattman – Workforce Board; Staff to Task Force

The next Task Force meeting will be held on November 28th, the same day as the STEM Summit at Microsoft, from 4-6 pm. Task Force members should have received an invitation to the STEM Summit.

Washington State Regional Education to Workforce Study
Jenee Myers, University of Washington

Jenee is a researcher at the University of Washington and co-founder of the Dream Project which pairs college students with high school students who would be the first in their families to go to college. The project collected data about the different tracks that students were on and found that, for a number of students, it wasn't that they weren't career or college ready, but that they didn't have the information they needed for next steps.

The research team took the three most populous counties and looked at all of the students who have ever touched part of the education and workforce system, and then looked at what jobs they were getting. That report will be out at the

end of October 2017. The results showed that most kids stay within 50 miles of home to connect to education and the workforce. This could mean that they are unable to leave home due to other issues or expectations, such as financial barriers. Those three counties have half the population of the state and half the higher education.

It is important to note that apprenticeships aren't tracked in the Employment Security data at all because they are state-by-state. The Workforce Board data has been helpful in learning which apprenticeships lead to jobs and living wages.

Report recommendations: There needs to be different types of postsecondary opportunities for each region of the state. We need to be producing folks with the right type of education to meet job needs. Our region needs more Bachelor degree holders than anywhere else in the state or in the country. We need to be aware of what message we are sending so that kids are getting the right education. We are looking at access to education data to have this picture at our fingertips to identify key investment areas. We need to strategically think about post-high school and employment readiness.

Question for the Task Force: Is there something you'd like to see out of this research that will help this group make better decisions? Responses included:
- The proportion of degree-seeking students who get a degree and go into the job market and then return to school because they went into a field they felt pushed into rather than attracted. What motivates the student?
- Tracking students during the "10 year drift." Where is the disconnect?
- Any data on what drives the student's chosen field? What environment are they learning about their opportunities?

Discussion
Is the data around credentials and certificates, and how is it collected now?
- *Right now in our state, if you get some sort of credential at an accredited institution, it all goes into a database called IPEDS. Apprenticeship doesn't necessarily run through a higher education institute – but it's on Career Bridge.*

This area being the highest concentration requiring bachelor's degree does that focus on the job descriptions or is skills based? How are you prepared to adapt your research for skills versus degrees?
- *Getting info from Employment Security Department (ESD) on jobs and what they typically require for education. Around here there are a lot of liberal arts Bachelors degrees flooding the market that aren't aligned to STEM jobs that are available, so those employees with degrees are still having to work their way up. And then companies such as Microsoft and others will continue hiring Associates degrees with coding skills. We want to do use this information, and then add data from sites such as LinkedIn, and watch the changes in the job market in real time so that we can project the need.*
Out of all of the job openings in Washington State, only a third are in the three counties?
- *That's the ones that will go unfilled. And we just got new info from Employment Security Department that will update those slides.*

National Promising Practices in Apprenticeship
Brent Parton, New America

New America, a research think tank in Washington DC, has been conducting a study on youth apprenticeship in the United States. They have conducted a Literature Review of available research as well as interviews with leaders of past and current efforts. The next step was looking around at the current landscape and convening focus groups with high school students, parents, and recent graduates. Finally, researchers looked ahead at what some of the policy barriers, emerging best practices, and recommendations for public and private investment.

5 Key Findings
1. Today, **youth apprenticeship is an important opportunity space** aligned with mainstream thinking about problems facing American education and industry.
2. **The public is open to apprenticeship** targeting high school students.
3. The current national landscape is a **diverse, fragmented collection** of programs.
4. There are **historical reasons** for today's fragmented and limited landscape.
5. States are leading a **new wave** of efforts to expand youth apprenticeship.

Harvard Business Review released a report on degree inflation and the risks to employers who focus on too narrow a pathway. Some of the findings were:
- Longer time to hire
- Degree inflation
- Onboarding costs for someone coming out of a degree program and a non-degree program are about the same.

You can find the full report at http://www.hbs.edu/managing-the-future-of-work/Documents/dismissed-by-degrees.pdf There will be a second report coming in November talking about how many jobs requiring degrees currently that could use the apprenticeship model.

Youth apprenticeship suggests that industry engages early and helps design those pathways and programs. Polling suggests that the public sees apprenticeship as favorable. There does still seem to be a stigma about apprenticeship being for "other kids." New America convened focus groups to dig deeper into this issue and develop recommendations.

Selected Q/A from members:
The unions have been the stewards of apprenticeships for centuries. How are you seeing unions integrated into some of these efforts or how do you see the trajectory of integration over the coming years in the models around the countries?
- *Going back over time, there have been challenges to building a high school youth apprenticeship system, so any high school apprenticeship models existed outside of that. However, high school pre-apprenticeships have a strong connection with unions. That pipeline has actually worked well. The problem is that to get those, we need more registered apprenticeships in more areas.*

Washington already has a well-established registered apprenticeship system. What sort of differences do we foresee for a youth model?
- *There aren't currently very many youth apprenticeship models to look at country wide. Registered systems do not track ages so there is no way to differentiate. In that case we have to assume that the system functions in the same way regardless of participant age. One thing that we can say is that for a youth apprenticeship system to work like the Swiss model, there has to be a negotiation between educational institutions and the employer.*

Barriers and Proposed Solutions to Washington Apprenticeship Expansion
Elizabeth Smith, Labor and Industries, Apprenticeship Division

About 13,000 people are involved in apprenticeships in Washington State. Most are in the building and constructions trades. There are 239 apprenticeship sponsors in the state (like AJAC for example). In Washington, 8000 employers are involved in registered apprenticeship. We don't count unionized versus not. But the majority of them come from unionized organizations. Unions learned a long time ago that the best training model for them is registered apprenticeship.

You don't have to join a union to do an apprenticeship. A high number of unions do apprenticeship, but you don't have to be unionized to do apprenticeship. AJAC has relationship with union and non-union firms. Many of the new organizations coming in doing registered apprenticeship are not union affiliated.

L&I Suggested Expansion Strategies
- Not a lot of employers know about apprenticeship and how they could use it. Engaging in specific strategies could help with that.
- The model needs intermediaries – someone to work with the schools to find kids and businesses in need of workers. There needs to be funding for intermediaries.
- The system of apprenticeship could be improved for promoting and growing registered youth apprenticeships (RYA) in the state. A training fund to support RYA takes money and resources. Dedicated funding in the career and technical college (CTC) system could help.
- Increasing the effort to support employers in growing a registered apprenticeship program.

Jan Yoshiwara, State Board for Community and Technical Colleges
Amy Goings, Lake Washington Institute of Technology

The presentation focused on three key points:
- How can we scale up the registered youth apprenticeship system?
- How can we take advantage of the current infrastructure?
- How can CTCs help?

How do we set something up with scale in mind so we're not going program by program? How do we take advantage of the current infrastructure – assets we already have to develop CCL for young people? And how can the CTCs help as not the only partner, but a significant one?

If students are going to come to us when they're 30, what do we need to change to get them to come to us at 18?

One suggestion is to utilize more fully the Statewide Centers of Excellence. One of the roles of these centers is to provide pathways among K-12, CTCs, and universities and work with employers on getting feedback for curriculum, training, etc. These centers also work on the transferability of credits between sectors and between educational institutions.

As an example: the business engagement at Lake Washington Technical Institute has 2,000 employers and labor representatives who serve on program advisory committees—including Boeing, Microsoft, Amazon, medium and small local businesses. Employers donate equipment and time, inform curriculum, and provide internships, clinical placements, co-op work experience, and apprenticeships.

There are several pathways already available through the CTC system:
- **K-12 partnerships.** Technical high schools, dual credit agreements, senior year bridge courses, high school completion.
- **University partnerships.** Statewide transfer agreements with state's public and independent universities.
- **Dual credit.** Running Start, College in the High School, Advanced Placement.

Strategies for Engaging Youth Apprenticeships at Scale:
- Leverage employer partnerships to develop apprenticeships and work based learning for teens.
- Develop statewide system of college credit for K-12 career and technical education including apprenticeship and work based learning credits.
- Resources and faculty time.

Policy Recommendations
Eric Wolf, Workforce Board

The policies in your packet are a draft. We would like the chance to hear more about certain items or what might be missing. These are just some of the dream big ideas that have come up in your conversations over the last couple of meetings.

Staff will be looking for feedback from the task force on the Policy Recommendations handout to modify the documents in time for the November meeting. It is clear that there needs to be a discussion about policy priorities and legislative priorities.

Discussion:

Professional development for high school counselors could also be provided. There are those who don't know about running start and other programs. That would be a lot cheaper than some of the other suggestions.

Let's think about existing programs. Where are the gaps? That's part of what was discussed in previous proposals – how to build on the existing system. Also, any policy discussion that doesn't include labor as a major partner is missing the biggest part of our system.

We also need to think of the students with special needs and how to engage them.

Public transportation and getting youth to their apprenticeships is going to be a major barrier in many parts of the state.

CEMETS Team: Lessons Learned from ETH-Zurich's Apprenticeship Institute
Amy Liu, Microsoft
Natalie Pacholl, SEH America
Shana Peschek, Construction Center of Excellence

In the summer of 2017, Washington sent a delegation of 11 people to Switzerland to attend an intensive apprenticeship and vocational education and training (VET) institute at the prestigious ETH-Zurich university, titled CEMETS (Center on the Economics and Management of Education and Training Systems).

Over 10 days, the team was able to study, in-depth, every aspect of the Swiss youth apprenticeship system including business engagement strategies, the value of VET for students and businesses (or ROI), and career exploration components.

The team developed a list of questions for the use of the members to consider while participating in Governor Inslee's delegation to Zurich and Bern in November.

Meeting Adjourned at 3:15 pm.

DRAFT – CAREER CONNECT WASHINGTON SOLUTION IDEAS

Governor Inslee convened the Career Connect Washington Task Force (CCWTF) to develop recommendations for the 2019-2020 legislative biennium, which would advance his goal to **connect 100,000 students with career connected learning (CCL)** opportunities that prepare them for high-demand, high-wage jobs, with a focus on reaching low-income students, students of color, and English language learners. The following outlines the CCWTF's considerations of critical issues or barriers to achieving the goal, and possible solutions, including creating a single public-private partnership fund pool to address barriers, new business engagement strategies, marketing and awareness campaigns, and administrative and legislative policy changes.

Policy Topic Areas

- Career Connect Washington System Planning
- Career Planning
- Align Career and Educational Pathways

- Expand Apprenticeship System
- Rural and Underserved Communities
- Staff Professional Development

		How do we make this happen?	Public sector role	Private sector role
CCW System Planning	**Develop a Strategic Plan to Implement Career Connect Washington:** Identify a special assistant to the Governor to oversee an inclusive planning process that includes leaders from business, labor, government, education, parents, and students. A strategic plan will result in detailed recommendations to encourage industry engagement in the state's envisioned CCL system. The plan will also provide recommendations for the development of long-term governance structure and funding system.	Launch a brief (6-9 month) facilitated strategic planning process that will build from the policy solutions identified by the CCWTF and the NGA Policy Academy on Work-Based Learning.	Identify and reduce regulatory barriers. Create connective tissue between separately governed agencies. Statewide inventory of existing programs – what do we have, what can we build from, what do we need?	Provide input on mechanisms that would make it easy for businesses to navigate their involvement with public education institutions, apprenticeship programs, and the workforce development system.
Career Planning	**Support Career Exploration and Planning Before High School:** Require comprehensive career exploration and "High School and Beyond Planning" to begin in middle school, and continue throughout high school. Content and materials should be updated as needed to reflect the most current career pathway maps.	Create a formal career exploration course for students in 7th or 8th grade. Provide resources and tools to teachers and counselors to support their students' career planning. Leverage nonprofits and community-based organizations to incorporate career planning into programming.	Identify administrative and statutory changes and resources necessary for implementation. OSPI-led implementation effort.	Highlight the impact of a lack of career readiness preparation in the workforce pipeline. Provide opportunities for middle school student career exploration activities. Develop marketing campaigns and technology tools to help enhance awareness and delivery.

		How do we make this happen?	Public sector role	Private sector role
Align Career and Educational Pathways	**K-8 Redesign:** Transform the foundational years of our education system to prepare all young people to effectively navigate career pathways.	Identify student-centered approaches that have been proven to provide students with the foundational skills and competencies needed to make good educational and career choices.	Impact analysis and implementation planning. Propose legislative action needed for statutory and funding changes.	Champion the business case for a redesigned system, including advocacy for funding. Provide opportunities for middle school student career exploration activities.
	Map Career Pathways: Engage industry in a regular process to map the career opportunities currently available and likely to be available in the near future, including specific details on standards for knowledge, skills, and abilities at each occupational level, and the various routes to industry-valued credentials.	Convene regional and state industry advisory committees for sectors or occupations in high-demand areas. Strengthen the capacity of the Education Research and Data Center (ERDC) to enable frequent, timely data on CCL, including education and workforce outcomes. Start with high-demand, high-growth sectors to prioritize limited resources.	Support intermediary, sector-specific organizations such as Centers of Excellence, industry associations, and Workforce Development Councils. Collapse individual program-level advisory committees into regional and state entities. Resource the ERDC to allow for comprehensive data on CCL opportunities.	Commit to a sustained co-leadership and active participation.
	Credential/Credit Portability: From high school, through postsecondary, into the workplace, learning should be easily applied towards progress along a career pathway.	Create a seamless system for assessing and recording (transcripting) credit or credential attainment for transferability and stackability across educational institutions and programs.	Current funds provided for equivalency work would require an increase to expand course equivalencies. Convene K-12 and postsecondary partners to expand articulation agreements.	Help evaluate whether changes in credentialing meet employer needs.

		How do we make this happen?	Public sector role	Private sector role
Expand Apprenticeship System	**Support Registered Youth Apprenticeship Expansion:** Support intermediaries to facilitate connections between schools and employers to establish new registered youth apprenticeship programs.	Identify best practices for scaling from the Career Connect WA RFP (and the community proposals it generated) and AJAC registered youth apprenticeship projects. Provide resources to new project sites. Fund intermediary activities, such as a staff navigator position at Labor & Industries.	Develop policies and practices for scalability based upon findings from early efforts.	Commit to sponsoring youth registered apprentices. Work with local partnerships to develop pathways for youth apprenticeship in a range of industries.
	Expand Apprenticeship Capacity: Establish and set aside specific funding dedicated to registered apprenticeship programs in the community and technical college system as well as high schools and skills centers. Funds will support expansion of existing programs to meet industry demand, and spur the creation of new apprenticeships in high-employer demand occupations.	Resource SBCTC to allow an update to their "Apprenticeship Fee Guidance," which has colleges waiving 50 percent of tuition & fees, which currently limits program expansion. Provide additional resources to sustain and expand apprenticeship programs at the secondary and postsecondary level.	SBCTC should perform an analysis of state Youth and Adult Registered Apprenticeship models, and develop a comprehensive funding plan to increase capacity. Identify expansion opportunities and resource needs for expansion of registered youth apprenticeship in high schools and skill centers.	Commit resources to work with high schools, skill centers and CTCs to expand existing programs and develop new ones.
Rural and Underserved Communities	**Provide the Infrastructure to Equalize Access to CCL Opportunities:** How a student accesses CCL opportunities, whether physically or virtually, needs to be a core part of any pathway plan.	Potential solutions are wide ranging, from financial support to provide transportation, to increasing broadband distribution and access, to supporting mobile training units and faculty. The Task Force might also consider recommending development of an access fund.	Funding enhancements in K-12 education could support transportation for CCL and mobile training units. Capital investments needed in rural areas of the state to allow for the necessary fiber to support broadband access (public-private partnership).	Industry champions are needed to highlight the value of an extensive infrastructure investment. Capital investments needed in rural areas of the state to allow for the necessary fiber to support broadband access (public-private partnership). Microsoft has a new project – White Space – which could help bridge the broadband divide.

		How do we make this happen?	Public sector role	Private sector role
Staff Professional Development	**Build Capacity of Education, Community, and Industry Partners to Provide High Quality Career Connected Learning:** Support increased professional development to all partners engaged in the CCL system, including mechanisms for evaluation, shared learning, and the development of tools and resources for distribution.	Funding support for professional development activities, including model curriculum toolkits. Multi-year effort should also include changes to pre-service teacher training programs.	Identify organizations to develop model curriculum and resources, e.g. OSPI, teacher training programs, and the Education Center of Excellence. Support regional hubs to roll out professional development activities and provide ongoing support, e.g. Educational Service Districts (ESDs), STEM Networks, and Workforce Development Councils.	Engage in the creation of professional development strategy and advise on the necessary components in professional development for industry to effectively partner on CCL. Identify mechanisms to encourage industry participation in CCL professional development.

Career Connect Washington – Full List of Policy Ideas

K-8 Redesign/Core and Pathways: Increase K-8 school hours, expand access to high-demand CTE and CCL, increase exploratory CTE options in middle school beyond STEM, create full-time Skill Center options.

Create New, In-demand Career Pathways: Create state-wide secondary-to-postsecondary articulation agreements to accelerate attainment of industry-valued postsecondary credentials, and stackable work-based learning experiences.

Expand Course Equivalency Options: Expand course equivalency options to all academic credit areas and require districts to adopt statewide equivalency frameworks.

Increase Dual Credit Opportunities: Increase dual credit offerings at no cost to students; align youth apprenticeship, internship, and worksite learning to statewide equivalency credit and dual credit opportunities; rebrand TechPrep as CTE Dual Credit.

Map Career Pathways: Develop additional articulation agreements between school districts and community and technical colleges, and ensure they are cataloged in a navigable way.

Develop and Allocate Resources for Navigators: To grow and facilitate work-based learning and apprenticeship connections between schools and employers.

Support Start-Up Apprenticeship Efforts: Develop a training fund that can support start-up of registered apprenticeship efforts. Establish and set-aside specific funding dedicated to registered apprenticeship in the community college system.

Create Apprenticeship Incentives: Incent employers to take on apprentices. Increase the Number of apprenticeable occupations, and employers willing to take on apprentices.

Strengthen High School and Beyond Planning: Create model tools and resources to help with implementation, and align with postsecondary planning tools.

Enhance Career Exploration Tools for Students: Invest additional funding into the state's CareerBridge website (www.careerbridge.wa.gov), specifically to enhance user experience for K-12 audience.

Pilot Middle School Career Exploration Courses: Create a formal career exploration course administered to students before high school.

Support expansion of Guided Pathways within CTC system and into secondary and workforce systems.

Increase Professional Development to Instructors and Counselors: Increase state support for instructional and counselor staff professional development specifically geared towards creating CCL opportunities.

Enhance the Role of Regional Educational Service Districts: Washington's network of Educational Service Districts (ESDs) could serve as a model or launch platform for regionally based hubs to coordinate professional development related to CCL & CTE.

Integrate CCL Resources into One Toolkit: Create a one-stop portal with resources educators can adapt for local use, providing a toolkit for practitioners to integrate career exploration into their work.

Improve transportation access to CCL and CTE opportunities: Reliable transportation to and from regional Skill Centers and workplace learning opportunities should be a required component of personal pathway planning for each student.

Support the creation of satellite and/or mobile Skill Centers in underserved regions: School districts could be supported to institute "block scheduling" where needed to facilitate the sharing of instructional resources and staff across school districts.

Support broadband distribution to remote and underserved regions. Universal broadband would allow institutions across the state to build technology-supported communities of learning.

Combine Secondary and Postsecondary CTE Advisory Committees: Collapse secondary and postsecondary CTE Industry Advisory Committees into single, regional entities.

Create Industry Sector Advisory Committees: Create state-level secondary and postsecondary industry advisory committees for sectors or occupations that are critical to the state's economy as a whole.

Identify Coordinators of Business Engagement within the Public Sector: Create single points of contact in each region of the state for businesses to engage in CCL activities. Encourage/Require coordinators to learn about elements of registered apprenticeship sponsorship and how they could coordinate, lead and assist employers and industries to develop and sponsor apprenticeship programs for their industry/area.

Expand Access to Career Contextualized Curriculum: Develop industry-supported, career-contextualized curriculum for additional in-demand occupations (such as the CorePlus model for aerospace and advanced manufacturing).

Establish Fund to Support Distribution and Statewide Scale of High Quality Career-Connected Learning: Funds may be directed by a private or quasi-public governing board. Funds would support capacity-building for the entire system of learning, require industry-school/program co-investment, and ensure that proven practices are sustained beyond the life of grant funds.